Mohamed Atta’s U.S. visa issued in Berlin, Germany on May 18, 2000, 10 days after he acquired a new passport.
Ramzi Binalshibh’s May 17, 2000 visa application with handwritten notes of U.S. consular officials. This visa application was denied July 18, 2000 under INA section 214(b), the “intending immigrant” provision.
A partly-burned copy of Ziad Jarrah’s U.S. visa recovered from the Flight 93 crash site in Somerset County, Pennsylvania.
First page of Hani Hanjour’s Sept. 10, 2000 visa application. The handwritten notes of a U.S. consular official (top right) indicate concern about Hanjour’s desire to stay in the United States for three years. This application was incomplete; Hanjour did not specify the name and address of the school he claimed to be attending.
Second page of Hanjour’s visa application.
Marwan al Shehhi’s Sept. 15, 2000 application to change his immigration status (I-539) from tourist to vocational student in order to enroll in flight training school. The application was approved on August 9, 2001.
Part 4. Additional Information. (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Are you, or any other person included in this application, an applicant for an immigrant visa or adjustment of status to permanent residence?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Has an immigrant petition ever been filed by you, or for any other person included in this application?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Have you, or any other person included in this application ever been arrested or convicted of any criminal offense since last entering the U.S.?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Have you, or any other person included in this application done anything which violated the terms of the nonimmigrant status you now hold?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Are you, or any other person included in this application, now in exclusion or deportation proceedings?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Have you, or any other person included in this application, been employed in the U.S. since last admitted or granted an extension or change of status?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If you answered YES to question 31, give the following information on a separate paper: Name of person, name of employer, address of employer, weekly income, and whether specifically authorized by INS.

If you answered NO to question 31, fully describe how you are supporting yourself on a separate paper. Include the source and the amount and basis for any income.

Part 5. Signature. Read the information on penalties in the instructions before completing this section. You must file this application while in the United States.

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that this application, and the evidence submitted with it, is all true and correct.

I authorize the release of any information from my records which the Immigration and Naturalization Service needs to determine eligibility for the benefit I am seeking.

Signed: Marwan Alshehhi
Printed Name: Marwan Yousef Alshehhi
Date: 09/15/2000

Please Note: If you do not completely fill out this form, or fail to submit required documents listed in the instructions, you cannot be found eligible for the requested document and this application will have to be denied.

Part 6. Signature of person preparing form if other than above. (Sign below)

I declare that I prepared this application at the request of the above person and it is based on all information of which I have knowledge.

Signature: Print Your Name: Date:

(Please remember to enclose the mailing label with your application)
Mohand al Shehri’s Oct. 23, 2000 visa application. This application was incomplete. He claimed to be a student (#24), but failed to clearly state the name and address of his school (#10). He also claimed to be supporting himself during his proposed 6-month visit to the United States. This application was approved.
Page 2 of Mohand al Shehri’s visa application.
Ahmad al Haznawi’s Nov. 12, 2000 visa application. Although he claimed to be a student (#24), he left blank the name and address of his school (#10). He also claimed to be supporting himself while in the United States. This application was approved.
Page 2 of Haznawi’s visa application.
Nov. 13, 2000 visa application for Saeed al Ghamdi (not the hijacker of the same name). Handwritten notes (upper right) of a consular officer indicate that his visa was denied because he was unemployed, lacked sufficient finances to support his trip and told officials that he planned to stay one year in the United States.
Page 2 of al Ghamdi’s denied visa application. To our knowledge he was the only potential Saudi hijacker denied a U.S. visa.
Ahmed al Nami’s April 23, 2001 visa application. The presence of notes in the upper right suggests that he was briefly questioned by consular officials. This was his second visa application even though his previous visa had not expired. Nami submitted this application with a new passport perhaps in order to hide travel to Afghanistan in the old passport.
Page 2 of Nami’s visa application.
Mohamed Atta’s revised immigration arrival record (I-94) created on May 2, 2001 at the Miami INS district office. Atta had gone to the office seeking a length of stay equal to the 8-months he received for a colleague—possibly Ziad Jarrah. Tourists were not normally granted a length of stay of more than 6 months. The INS officer in Miami refused to grant 8 months to Jarrah and instead rolled-back Atta’s length of stay to the standard six months, until July 9, 2001. He departed the United States on July 7 and returned on July 19, at which time he was granted another 6-month length of stay.
Handwritten notes of the immigration official at the Miami district office who rolled-back Atta’s length of stay.
Immigration arrival record (I-94) for Saeed al Ghamdi.
Saeed al Ghamdi’s Customs Declaration presented at arrival.
Identification obtained by Salem al Hazmi. In addition, Ahmed al Ghamdi, Nawaf al Hazmi, Majed Moqed, and Abdul Aziz al Omari obtained similar USA identification cards.
Identification obtained by Khalid al Mihdhar. The address listed is for a hotel.
Visa application submitted on behalf of Khalid Sheikh Mohammed. Although KSM was on a terrorist watchlist, this application was submitted under an alias name. The
application was approved but there is no evidence that KSM used this visa to enter the United States.

---

Page 2 of KSM’s visa application. He is pictured at the lower right.
Ahmed al Ghamdi’s photo as it appeared on his state of Virginia identification card. Ziad Jarrah, Abdul Aziz al Omari and Salem al Hazmi also obtained Virginia state identification cards. The hijackers used false affidavits to obtain their identification.
Appendix B
The Saudi Flights

At 9:45 A.M. on September 11, 2001, the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) Air Traffic Control System Command Center (ATCSCC) issued verbal direction for all airborne aircraft to land at the nearest destination or as soon as practical. A notice to all airmen (NOTAM) was issued at 10:39 closing all operations at all airports; at 11:06, ATCSCC suspended operations in the national airspace.

While the national airspace was closed, decisions to allow aircraft to fly were made collaboratively with the departments of Defense and State, the U.S. Secret Service, the FBI, and the FAA. The Department of Transportation reopened the national airspace to commercial flights effective 11 A.M. on September 13, 2001, provided the airport had implemented the new security measures dictated by the FAA Civil Aviation Security Office. The reopening for commercial flights included hired charter flights, but so-called general aviation flights by individuals flying for pleasure continued to be restricted at some airports.

A number of flights with Saudi nationals departed the United States for domestic and international destinations after airspace was reopened. Our investigation revealed 11 such flights between September 13 and September 24, 2001.

We have determined that the airports involved in these 11 Saudi flights were open when the flights departed. We have found no credible evidence that any of these flights of Saudi nationals flew within the United States or departed from the United States before the reopening of the national airspace.

Although the airspace and airports were open when these flights left, we have investigated the process by which these individuals were able to leave the United States. It began with a phone call around September 13, 2001. Fearing reprisals against Saudi nationals, Rihab Massoud, deputy chief of mission of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia in Washington, D.C., called Dale Watson, the FBI’s assistant director for counterterrorism, shortly after the attack and asked for help in getting some of the Kingdom’s citizens out of the country.

At about the same time, Michael Rolince, the FBI section chief of the International Terrorism Operations Section (ITOS), learned about a proposed flight of Saudi nationals intending to depart the country from Newark, New Jersey. Rolince told FBI officials in the field that the Saudis should not be allowed to leave until the names on their passports had been matched to their faces, and their names had been run through various databases—including some watchlists—to see whether the FBI had derogatory information on them. The next morning, Watson and Rolince briefed FBI Director Robert Mueller about the issue.

The Saudi government was advised of the requirements the FBI wanted met before the flights could leave: identification and name check. The Saudi government agreed to this
policy, and in most cases provided a flight manifest to the FBI in advance of the flight’s proposed departure.\textsuperscript{11} In the FBI Special Intelligence and Operations Center (SIOC), Rolince took on responding to matters related to the Saudi flights as part of his duties.\textsuperscript{12} Other U.S. government agencies played a role as well—often by video teleconference. The FAA had a representative assigned to the FBI SIOC who worked to ensure that the FBI was aware of flights of Saudi nationals and was able to screen the passengers before they were allowed to depart.\textsuperscript{13} The State Department was involved in flights involving Saudi royalty and diplomats because in some circumstances diplomatic flights are accorded special privileges.\textsuperscript{14}

At the White House, Counterterrorism Security Coordinator Richard Clarke participated through the Counterterrorism Security Group (CSG) process.\textsuperscript{15} Clarke told the Commission that he approved the release of these flights subject to the FBI’s approval.

So, I was told that the Saudi embassy wanted to get people out of the country who were royal family members, and who were Bin Ladin family members. I asked the FBI, Dale Watson, who was the senior number two, I think person at the FBI at the time, to handle that, to check to see if that was all right with them, to see if they wanted access to any of these people, and to get back to me. And if they had no objections, it would be fine with me. . . .

Now your next question is going to be, who in the White House did I clear it with, or did I clear it with anybody in the White House. And I have no recollection of clearing it with anybody in the White House. I may have. But it’s more than likely, when the FBI said it was all right with them, I told whoever had asked me that it was all right with me. And again, I don’t, I have no idea who asked me.

Contextually here, this is coming at a time when we were being hit with information and requests for decisions on matters that normally we would take weeks to decide, and we’re deciding them in about two minutes. And this was one in a flow of hundreds, if not thousands, of decisions that we made during the course of those first 72 hours. . . .

This is the kind of thing that I have done many, many times on the other side of the request. It is very frequently the case that when there is an emergency situation in another country, we approach that country and ask for extraordinary help in evacuating our people. And I’ve done that a lot. And so I had sympathy with their request.\textsuperscript{16}
Clarke appears to be the highest-ranking official in the White House involved with the decision to approve the departure of the Saudi flights. There is no evidence of involvement by senior political officials.

President Bush and Vice President Cheney told the Commission that they did not speak with Saudi government officials about the flights before their departure. The President told the Commission that the first he knew about the issue was when he read about it in the newspaper. Although White House Chief of Staff Andrew Card remembered someone telling him about the Saudi request shortly after 9/11, he said he had not talked to the Saudis and did not ask anyone to do anything about it.17

Thus, decisions about these flights—including how much screening of the passengers should be done and whether they should be allowed to depart—appear to have been delegated from more senior officials at the FBI and by Richard Clarke at the White House to midlevel officials of the FBI, FAA, and State Department participating in the interagency decisionmaking process centered in the FBI SIOC.18

We pause to caution against overemphasizing the issue of authorizing the flights’ departure, because such a focus reveals ignorance of two key facts: first, prior to 9/11, there was virtually no screening of individuals seeking to leave the United States;19 and second, under U.S. law, the legal authority to prevent the departure of someone wishing to leave the United States is unusual and, we believe, seldom utilized. The first point is important because it answers people who have assumed, incorrectly, that some kind of authorization was required before the Saudi flights, or any others, could depart the United States in the wake of 9/11. The second underscores that assumptions about the FBI’s ability to detain all Saudis on these flights are misplaced as well. Unless the FBI developed facts justifying a detention, such as reason to believe the individual was in violation of their immigration status,20 had committed a crime, or was a material witness to a crime, it is not clear that actions to prevent any individual’s departure would have had a lawful basis.21

The more important question is, Did any terrorists escape from the U.S. on one of these flights? Our research to date leads us to believe the answer is no. Screening for flights, including the “Bin Ladin” flight carrying members of Usama Bin Ladin’s extended family, was done by FBI officials in the field according to a policy set by FBI headquarters personnel and in a process coordinated among agencies. The purpose of this screening was to ensure that the people on these flights did not pose a threat to national security and that no one of interest to the FBI in connection with the 9/11 investigation was allowed to leave the country. We believe that the FBI interviewed all persons of interest on these flights prior to their departures. The FBI has concluded that none of the passengers was connected specifically to the 9/11 attacks or to terrorism generally.

Because it was not clear to the Commission whether all departing passengers’ names were checked against the definitive source for terrorist identity information—the TIPOFF terrorist watchlist—at our request, prior to our hearing in April 2004, the Terrorist Screening Center (TSC) checked the names of individuals on the flight manifests of these
six Saudi flights against the current TIPOFF watchlist. There were no matches. Also at our request, drawing on additional information—including information collected by journalists researching this issue—the TSC in June and July 2004 rechecked the names of individuals believed to be on these six flights and on four more flights identified by 9/11 Commission staff since our April hearing as having one or more Saudi nationals as passengers. Again, there were no matches. Finally, we asked the TSC to check the names of 160 Saudi nationals listed on a Web site as having left the United States between September 11 and September 15, 2001. There were no matches.

It is our view that the FBI handled the screening of these flights in a professional manner consistent with the other pressing duties they faced after September 11, particularly the need to prevent the future terrorist attacks that many then feared were imminent.

The Flights

In April 2004, we reported that after U.S. airspace reopened, six chartered flights with 142 people, mostly Saudi nationals, departed from the United States between September 14 and 24. Since our initial report, we have found evidence of four more flights between September 14 and 23 containing two or more Saudi nationals. We also researched one flight that flew within the United States on September 13, 2001, a topic we were in the process of researching in April. Finally, we looked into departures of Saudi nationals on commercial flights after 9/11 that journalists had described as suspicious. We have identified the following flights:

2. The Providence flight. A Northstar Aviation flight with four Saudis, including a Saudi sheikh, that departed from Providence, Rhode Island, for Paris, France, on September 14, 2001;
3. The Newark flight. A Saudi Arabian Airlines flight with 116 individuals, including the Saudi deputy defense minister, that departed from Newark Airport on September 14, 2001.
4. The Lexington flight. A Jetlease chartered luxury Boeing 727 with 14 people, including a Saudi prince, that departed from Lexington, Kentucky, for an unknown city in England during the evening hours on September 16, 2001.
5. The Universal Weather flight. A Universal Weather & Aviation, Inc., flight with four Saudi nationals that departed from Boston’s Logan Airport for Gander, Newfoundland, at 12:30 P.M. on September 18, 2001
6. The First Las Vegas flight” Flight DC-8-73, a chartered Republic of Gabon airplane with 46 people, including several members of the Saudi royal family, that departed from Las Vegas, Nevada, for Geneva, Switzerland, on September 19, 2001.
7. The “Bin Ladin” flight. Ryan International Flight 441, a Boeing 727 with 26 passengers, most of them relatives of Saudi fugitive Usama Bin Ladin, that departed the United States from Boston, Massachusetts, for Goose Bay,


We address each flight in the order they flew, and then turn to the departures of Saudis on commercial flights.

The “Phantom Flight.” Much has been made of the Tampa flight, nicknamed the “Phantom flight” because of claims in media accounts, attributed to government officials at the FAA and FBI, that the flight had not in fact taken place. Our conclusion is that the flight definitely took place, and that there was nothing improper or unusual about it.

On September 13, 2001, Tampa police officers were providing security to three young Saudi nationals at an apartment in Tampa, Florida. One of the three was Prince Sultan Fahad bin Salman bin Abdulaziz, whose father, Prince Ahmed bin Salman bin Abdulaziz, was in Lexington, Kentucky, attending a horse auction. The Tampa Police Department was in contact with the Lexington Police Department about this security because the elder Prince Salman was concerned about his son’s safety and had contacted the Lexington police. At approximately 11 A.M., the Tampa police were told by the Saudis they were protecting that a plane had become available to fly them to Lexington. Tampa police were asked to provide two officers who could act as security guards for the three by accompanying them on the plane scheduled to leave the afternoon of September 13, 2001. The Tampa police chief declined to let his officers fly on the plane.

The Tampa sergeant handling the security arrangements then contacted Dan Grossi, a recently retired Tampa police detective and private investigator, and asked if he was interested in providing security services by flying to Lexington with the Saudis. Grossi agreed, and called another private investigator—Manuel Perez, a retired FBI agent—to accompany him on the flight. Tampa police officers drove the three Saudi nationals to the Tampa International Airport in unmarked police vehicles. The Tampa officers, accompanied by the three Saudi nationals, met Dan Grossi in the lobby of Raytheon Aircraft Services, a separate terminal at the Tampa airport. A Tampa police officer described seeing a plane that looked like a “cream-colored Learjet” on the tarmac outside the Raytheon facility. The Tampa officers waited with Grossi and the three young Saudis until Manuel Perez arrived, and then they left.
Grossi, Perez, the three Saudi nationals, and the two pilots then boarded the chartered plane, a Learjet model LJ35. The pilot of the Learjet was Christopher Steele, an employee of the plane’s owner, Hop-A-Jet, Inc. The plane’s unique identification number, based on the name of the company, was “HPJ32.” For Steele, there was “nothing unusual whatsoever” about the flight other than that there were few planes flying that day. Barry Ellis, Hop-A-Jet’s president and director of operations agreed, saying that “it was just a routine little trip for us” and that he would have heard if there had been anything unusual about it. Steele said he followed standard procedures and filed his flight plan with the FAA prior to the flight, noting, “I was never questioned about it.”

FAA records show Steele filed his flight plan at 3:30 P.M. on September 13, 2001, indicating the plane was flying from Tampa to Lexington, and then back to Tampa. According to FAA records, the plane took off from Tampa bound for Lexington at 4:38 P.M. on September 13, 2001. Witnesses, including security guards Grossi and Perez, recall the flight leaving at around 4:30. Tampa airport’s aircraft flight tracking system, which captures the jet noise made by arriving and departing aircraft, recorded the plane’s departure at 4:37. At the time this charter flight took off, both the national airspace and Tampa Airport were open. In fact, Tampa records show that 10 aircraft arrived at Tampa and 12 departed before Steele’s plane left. The FAA has stated they have “no record” of any special authorization for this flight.

At approximately 6 P.M., the plane landed at Lexington Blue Grass Airport and taxied to the Truman Arnold Corporation or TAC Air facility, separate from the main airport terminal. Lexington Blue Grass Airport had been open since 12:50 P.M. that day. The three Saudi nationals disembarked from the plane and were met by Captain Mark Barnard of the Lexington, Kentucky, Police Department, the same person who had been in contact with Tampa police officers earlier in the day. Grossi and Perez were paid for their work by the Saudis, and were given money with which to pay the off-duty Tampa police officers. Barnard escorted the three Saudi nationals to a hotel where the prince joined his father. The plane refueled at the TAC Air facility and, according to FAA records, departed Lexington for Tampa at 6:43 P.M. On board were the two pilots, Dan Grossi, and Manuel Perez. The three Saudis on the Tampa–Lexington flight stayed in Lexington until September 16, 2001, when they departed the United States on a flight described below.

Thus, there does not appear to be anything unusual about the so-called Phantom Flight other than that it was one of the earlier charter flights flown after airspace reopened.

**The Providence Flight.** On September 14, 2001, a Northstar Aviation flight to Paris, France, departed from Providence, Rhode Island.

- There were four Saudi nationals on board.
- According to the FBI, all four passengers “were interviewed and their identity confirmed.”
The FBI made copies of the passengers’ passports. According to the FBI, the FBI and INS checked the four individual’s names against FBI and INS databases “with negative results.” The FBI also reported that the U.S. Customs Service and Rhode Island State Police searched their luggage “with negative results.” It is not clear whether these individuals were checked against the State Department’s TIPOFF terrorist watch list prior to their departure, but a check of their names in April 2004 produced no matches. According to the Transportation Security Administration, Providence Airport was open when this flight departed.

The Newark Flight. A Saudi Arabian Airlines flight with 116 individuals, including the Saudi deputy defense minister, Prince Abdul Rahman bin Abdul Aziz, departed from Newark International Airport on September 14, 2001, at approximately 9:25 P.M. We do not know its immediate destination.

FBI agents received a flight manifest for this flight containing the names, dates of birth, and country of citizenship or residency of all passengers in advance of its departure. FBI records indicate that these individuals were checked against four databases: IIIA (containing FBI analysts’ reports), TECS (the U.S. Customs Service watchlist system), ACS (the FBI’s Automated Case System), and Rapid Start (containing FBI leads, including those related to the 9/11 investigation, known as PENTTBOM). Based on these checks, at least one of the crew members was interviewed extensively. His answers apparently satisfied the FBI and he was allowed to depart. At our request, the Terrorist Screening Center in July 2004 checked the names of the passengers on this flight against the TIPOFF watchlist; there were no matches. At the time this flight departed, Newark Airport was open.


There were 14 individuals on board, the majority of whom were Saudi nationals, including Saudi Prince Ahmed Bin Salman Bin Abdulaziz and his son Prince Sultan Bin Fahad Bin Salman Abdulaziz; the latter had flown to Lexington from Tampa, Florida, on September 13, 2001. The FBI copied the passports of all 14 passengers prior to their departure and made sure that those who boarded the plane were the same individuals whose passports they had collected. The FBI and U.S. Customs Service inspected the plane before it departed. Although they did speak with one passenger prior to the plane’s departure, and records show the passengers were checked against the Security Directive List (an FBI watchlist created shortly after 9/11), there is no evidence that the FBI
interviewed these 14 individuals or checked their names against other terrorist watchlists prior to their departure.69

- Lexington Blue Grass Airport was open at the time this flight took off.70
- One individual on this flight—Ahmad A. M. al Hazmi—has the same last name as hijackers Nawaf and Salem al Hazmi. However, the FBI determined that he was not on any watchlists associated with the 9/11 attacks.71
- The Terrorist Screening Center checked the names of the passengers on this flight in April 2004 with no matches.

We found no evidence to support the allegation that Prince Ahmed Bin Salman, a passenger on the flight, had ties to al Qaeda operative Abu Zubaydah and may have had advanced knowledge of the 9/11 attacks. This claim was allegedly made by Zubaydah after his capture when he was interrogated by the CIA.72 We have seen no evidence of any such statement, and the CIA has stated they have “no intelligence reporting to support” this assertion.73


- We learned of this flight while reviewing FBI documents in preparation for our April 13, 2004, hearing.
- We were not able to determine the destination of this flight from the documents we reviewed.
- FBI records of this flight included a flight manifest with the names and other biographical information of four Saudi nationals.
- Because we were not able to determine whether the names of these four individuals had been checked against TIPOFF, at our request in April the Terrorist Screening Center checked these four individuals against TIPOFF with negative results.
- Boston’s Logan Airport was open when this flight departed.74

The Las Vegas Flights. The FBI reports that it “conducted extensive investigation prior to the departure” of the three Las Vegas flights based on a lead it received about the presence of Saudis in Las Vegas on September 11, 2001.75 Two of these flights, one September 19, 2001 and one on September 20, 2001, contained members of the entourage of Saudi Prince Abdulmajeed Bin Abdulaziz.76

- Republic of Gabon–Flagged DC-8-73

On September 19, 2001, Flight DC-8-73, tail number TR-LTZ, a chartered Republic of Gabon airplane, departed Las Vegas, Nevada, for Geneva, Switzerland. This flight contained members of the party of Prince Abdulmajeed bin Abdulaziz.77

- There were 69 people aboard this flight, 46 of whom were Saudi nationals, according to the FBI.78
Before the flight took off, the FBI acquired the name, date or year of birth, passport numbers, and copies of passports for all 69 people scheduled to board. The FBI checked their names against “the current FBI Watch List and ran for IIIA reports. No Watch List matches were discovered.”

FBI records state that agents interviewed three of the passengers based on nonderogatory information in its IIIA database, but found nothing suspicious. The FBI also reported that “Additional interviews were conducted by INS and USCS [the U.S. Customs Service].”

Before the flight was allowed to leave, the plane was searched and FBI agents and agents of the U.S. Customs Service matched all passengers to the flight manifest and to photocopies of their passports.

Although FBI records indicate that Customs personnel assisted in the investigation of this flight, it is not clear from FBI records whether the names of passengers on this flight were checked against the Customs-TECS database, which included the TIPOFF terrorist database, prior to its departure.

The Terrorist Screening Center ran the names of all passengers on this flight against TIPOFF in April 2004; there were no matches.

Las Vegas Airport was open when this flight departed.

Chartered Flight B 727-21, Tail Number N727PX

On September 20, 2001, 18 members of the party of Saudi Prince Abdulmajeed Bin Abdulaziz departed from Las Vegas, Nevada, for Stanstead, England. They underwent the same vetting process as the 69 people on the flight the day before.

The FBI checked the 18 names against “the current FBI Watch List and ran for IIIA reports. No Watch List matches were discovered.”

FBI records state that agents interviewed one passenger based on nonderogatory information in its IIIA database, but found nothing suspicious.

Before the flight was allowed to leave, the plane was searched and FBI agents and agents of the U.S. Customs Service matched all passengers to the flight manifest and to photocopies of their passports.

Although FBI records indicate that Customs personnel assisted in the investigation of this flight, it is not clear from FBI records whether the names of passengers on this flight were run against the Customs-TECS database, which included the TIPOFF terrorist database, prior to its departure.

At our request, the Terrorist Screening Center ran the names of all passengers on this flight against TIPOFF in April 2004; there were no matches.

Las Vegas Airport was open when this flight departed.


The screening of this flight was directed by an FBI agent in the Baltimore Field Office who was also a pilot. This agent, coordinating with FBI headquarters,
sent an electronic communication to each of the field offices within whose jurisdiction the Bin Ladin flight was scheduled to land; it including the proposed flight manifest and directions regarding what screening should occur. The communication directed agents in those offices to verify the identities of the passengers and ensure “that the flight did not pose a threat to US security.” The Baltimore agent monitored the flight as it moved around the country—from St. Louis to Los Angeles to Orlando to Washington Dulles and to Boston Logan—correcting for any changes in itinerary to make sure there was no lapse in FBI screening.

- The flight manifest indicates that when the flight departed the United States, there were 26 individuals on board other than the flight crew: 23 passengers and 3 security guards.
- Most of the 23 passengers were Saudi nationals. Most of the Saudis were relatives of Usama Bin Ladin, and 12 had the last name Bin Ladin.
- The FBI interviewed 19 of the 23 passengers on Flight 441, some of them more than once. The interviews took place in a number of locations, including the passengers’ homes, in automobiles, and at the airport; some were done over the telephone. FBI agents also spoke with the flight crew of Flight 441 and the three security guards who accompanied the passengers prior to the flight’s departure.
- Records of the interviews the FBI conducted of Bin Laden Flight passengers—which amount to 39 single-spaced typed pages—indicate that the FBI interviewed many of these individuals at some length. They were questioned, for example, about their personal biographical information; where they lived; which of their relatives lived in the United States and where; what relationship, if any, they had with Usama Bin Ladin; when, if ever, they had seen Usama Bin Ladin; their knowledge of terrorist groups or activity; whether they had ever traveled to Afghanistan or Pakistan; whether they knew any of the 9/11 hijackers; and whether they had any information about the attacks. Many family members told the FBI that they had lived or traveled in the West for years. Some of the Bin Ladins declared that they were U.S. citizens. None of the passengers claimed to have had any recent contact with Usama Bin Ladin or any knowledge about terrorist activity.
- Two of the passengers on the Bin Ladin flight had been the subjects of preliminary investigations by the FBI; both their cases had been closed, in 1999 and March 2001, respectively, because the FBI had uncovered no derogatory information on either person linking him to terrorist activity. Their cases remained closed as of September 11, 2001; they were not reopened before they departed the country on this flight and have not been reopened since.
- The flight originated in St. Louis on September 18, 2001. It acquired its passengers as follows: in Los Angeles, one passenger embarked, and the flight departed on September 19, 2001; in Orlando, Florida, three passengers embarked, and the flight departed September 19, 2001; in Washington, D.C., five passengers embarked, and the flight departed September 19, 2001; in Boston, fourteen passengers embarked and the flight departed at 2:05 A.M. on September 20, 2001.
FBI agents verified the names of passengers on Flight 441 in Los Angeles, Orlando, and Boston.⁹⁹

FBI agents searched the airplane and luggage in Los Angeles and Orlando. The FBI searched the plane prior to its departure in Boston.¹⁰⁰

“At each airport, passengers were processed through immigration and customs as well as security checks.”¹⁰¹

In Boston, the FBI photographed all 14 individuals boarding the aircraft.

“Record checks were conducted” of the passengers.

One claim that has been made is that the FBI helped shuttle Bin Ladin family members to this flight. We found that in two cases, when the FBI called members of the Bin Ladin family in connection with their plans to depart the country, the Bin Ladins asked the FBI agents to accompany them to the airport because they were afraid for their and their family’s safety.¹⁰² In one instance, the FBI agent agreed that there was the potential for danger to someone with the last name “Bin Ladin.”¹⁰³ That agent, in Florida, provided an escort to the airport for three Bin Ladin family members because of their fears and took the opportunity to interview one of the family members during the drive.¹⁰⁴ In a second case, Usama Bin Ladin’s sister, who lived in Los Angeles, requested an escort on September 19, 2001 to the airport in Los Angeles because she was concerned about her safety. An FBI agent agreed to and did accompany her to the airport.¹⁰⁵

The four Ryan Air flight 441 passengers who were not interviewed were Maria Bayma, apparently the sister-in-law of Khalil Bin Laden, Usama Bin Ladin’s brother; Sultan Bin Ladin, the “17- to 18”-year-old son of Khalil Bin Ladin; a female Saudi national who embarked in Boston; and an Indonesian maid who worked for one of the Saudi passengers.¹⁰⁶ There is strong evidence that the first three individuals, although they were not interviewed separately, “were present during interviews” of others.¹⁰⁷

The FBI has stated, on the basis of their investigation of the individuals on the Ryan Air Flight, that there were “no siblings of UBL’s with ties to Militant Islamic Fundamentalists aboard the flight.”¹⁰⁸

The FBI maintains that “no persons received FBI approval to depart the US without being determined to be of no investigative interest to the PENTTBOM investigation.”¹⁰⁹

At our request, in April 2004 the Terrorist Screening Center ran the names of all the passengers on the Bin Ladin flight against the TIPOFF list; there were no matches.

Each of the airports through which the Bin Ladin flight passed was open and no special restrictions applied that were lifted to accommodate its passage.

**The VIP Flight.** A flight from New York’s JFK Airport with 12 people, including four members of the Saudi royal family, apparently departed for Paris on September 22, 2001.

From a story that surfaced in the media, we learned of a flight that apparently departed from New York’s JFK Airport on September 22, 2001.¹¹⁰

We obtained a copy of the alleged flight manifest from an Internet Web site.¹¹¹

Although we found evidence of a VIP flight that involved FBI screening, we have not been able to determine definitively whether this is the flight involved.¹¹²
Because it was not clear to us whether the individuals on this flight had been checked against terrorist watchlists, we asked the Terrorist Screening Center in June 2004 to run the names of all passengers against the TIPOFF terrorist watchlist; there were no matches.

New York’s JFK Airport was open when this flight departed.\textsuperscript{113}


- We learned of this flight while reviewing FBI documents in preparation for our April 13, 2004, hearing.
- FBI records of this flight included a flight manifest with the names of two Saudi nationals and other biographical information.
- Because we were not able to determine whether the names of these two individuals had been checked against TIPOFF, at our request in June 2004 the Terrorist Screening Center checked these two individuals against TIPOFF; there were no matches.
- Hanscom Airfield was open when this flight departed.\textsuperscript{114}

**American Trans Air Flight ATA L-1011.** On September 24, 2001, 34 members of the party of Saudi Prince Turki departed on Flight American Trans Air (ATA) L-1011 from Las Vegas, Nevada, to Paris, France.\textsuperscript{115}

- These 34 individuals underwent the same vetting process as the Saudis on flights that had left Las Vegas earlier. The FBI checked the 34 names against “the current FBI Watch List and ran for potential IIIA reports. Both checks met with negative results.”\textsuperscript{116}
- There were 19 Saudi citizens on board.\textsuperscript{117}
- The plane was searched before the flight was allowed to leave.
- FBI agents and agents of the U.S. Customs Service matched all passengers to the flight manifest and to photocopies of their passports.\textsuperscript{118}
- From our review of FBI records, it appears that none of the 34 people on this flight was interviewed.
- FBI records indicate that U.S. Customs Service personnel assisted in the investigation of this flight; however, it is not clear from FBI records whether the names of passengers on this flight were run against the Customs-TECS database, which included the TIPOFF terrorist database, prior to its departure.
- The Terrorist Screening Center ran the names of all passengers on this flight against TIPOFF in April 2004; there were no matches.
- Las Vegas Airport was open when this flight departed.\textsuperscript{119}

**Commercial flights of Saudi Nationals out of the United States.** In February 2004, the advocacy group Judicial Watch obtained through a Freedom of Information Act Request documents showing that 160 Saudi nationals departed the United States on 55 flights on September 11, 2001, and from September 13 to September 15, 2001.\textsuperscript{120} These documents, released by the Department of Homeland Security, Bureau of Customs and Border
Protection, do not include the names of the individuals. They do include each person’s
country of citizenship, class of admission, date of departure, port of departure, and flight
number. The records indicate that these 160 individuals departed from Atlanta,
Washington Dulles, JFK Airport, Boston, Houston, Chicago, and many other airports.

The FBI subsequently obtained from DHS the complete biographical information—
including name and passport number—of the individuals dealt with in this FOIA
request. At our request, in June 2004 the Terrorist Screening Center checked the names
of these individuals against the TIPOFF terrorist watchlist. There were no matches.

The fact that 160 Saudi nationals departed our country on commercial flights on
September 11, 2001 and after airspace reopened on September 13, 2001, is not
particularly remarkable. After the 13th, thousands of individuals departed on flights from
the United States, as they do every day that our airspace is open. As we noted above, the
United States did not have departure controls in the period immediately before and after
the 9/11 attacks.

---

2 Ibid.
3 Ibid.
4 Ibid.
5 See, e.g., Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, Response to QFR, July 9, 2004, stating, “There
were restrictions for GA flights that lasted until early October.”
6 The following airports met FAA’s new security requirements and reopened on September 13, 2001 at the
times listed: Tampa International (11 a.m.), Tampa International Airport record, Response to QFR, June 7,
2004; Lexington Blue Grass (12:50 p.m.), Lexington Blue Grass Airport record, Response to QFR, June 8,
2004; Lambert-St. Louis International (11 a.m.), Lambert-St. Louis International Airport record, Response
to QFR, May 27, 2004; Los Angeles International (12 p.m.), Los Angeles International Airport record,
Response to QFR, June 2, 2004; Orlando International (11 a.m.), Orlando International Airport record,
Response to QFR, June 8, 2004; Washington-Dulles (11 a.m.), Washington-Dulles Airport record,
Response to QFR, June 8, 2004; New York-JFK (11:04 a.m.), Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
record, “Review of JFK Operations Chrono for 9/11 Incident,” attachment to Response to QFR, June 4,
2004. Boston-Logan International Airport reopened to commercial activity at 5 a.m. on September 15,
2001. Massachusetts Port Authority, Responses to the Logan International Airport Questions for the
Record, June 17, 2004. The Transportation Security Administration has confirmed that the following
airports were open when the Saudi flights arrived or departed from them: Tampa, Lexington, Providence,
St. Louis, Los Angeles, Orlando, Washington-Dulles, Boston-Logan, Las Vegas, New York-JFK, and
Hanscom. Christine Beyer interview (July 14, 2004).
7 Rihab Massoud, Deputy Chief of Mission, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, interview (May 11, 2004); Dale
Watson interview (June 3, 2004). Watson recalls that Massoud called late at night and told him that they
were having a problem getting a plane released that carried “just family members.” Ibid. Massoud recalls
making clear that the plan was to gather all members of the Bin Ladin family on one flight, making several
stops, before departing the United States. Rihab Massoud, Deputy Chief of Mission, Kingdom of Saudi
Arabia, interview (May 11, 2004). Minister Massoud told the Commission that he worked to secure the
departure of three flights with Saudi nationals sponsored in some fashion by the Saudi government; one
flight with the Saudi Deputy Defense Minister on Saudi Airlines departing from Newark, New Jersey on
September 14, 2001; one flight from California by the Governor of Mecca on a plane registered to the
Republic of Gabon that departed from Las Vegas on September 19, 2001; and the flight of Bin Ladin
family members that departed Boston-Logan Airport on September 20, 2001. All three flights took place
after the national airspace had reopened. It appears from these records that State coordinated with the FBI and FAA to allow screening by the FBI of flights with Saudi nationals on board.

8 Michael Rolince interview (June 9, 2004).

9 Michael Rolince interview (June 9, 2004); Massoud corroborates this account. He said the FBI required the names and personal information of all departing passengers sponsored for departure by the Saudi Embassy. Rihab Massoud, Deputy Chief of Mission, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia interview (May 11, 2004).

10 Michael Rolince interview (June 9, 2004). Mueller responded by telling Rolince that this was the first he had heard of the Saudi flights issue. Ibid.

11 Michael Rolince interview (June 9, 2004); Massoud corroborates this account. He said the FBI required the names and personal information of all departing passengers sponsored for departure by the Saudi Embassy. Rihab Massoud, Deputy Chief of Mission, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, interview (May 11, 2004).

12 Michael Rolince interview (June 9, 2004).

13 Jack Salata interview (June 14, 2004). The FAA representative put the FBI in direct communication with FAA air traffic control, which would not clear any flights to depart until the FBI gave their clearance. Ibid.

14 See DOS record, “State Terrorist Attack Task Force Log,” June 3, 2004, stating in a log entry dated September 19, 2001, 8:34 p.m., “FAA requested DOS clearance for Saudi Registered aircraft to depart Las Vegas bound for Geneva, I checked with the FBI Las Vegas office. They confirmed that they had completed their interviews and had no objections to their departure. I then cleared their departure.” Records of State’s Terrorist Attack Task Force established after 9/11 contain 13 references to U.S. government coordination regarding flights of Saudi nationals, the earliest of which—including the Saudi Deputy Defense Minister—occurred after the reopening of national airspace on September 13, 2001. Ibid. One entry on September 15, 2001 regarding a proposed flight of Saudi royalty states “there is no issue of whether the Saudis may or may not depart the country, the only issue is whether they qualify for diplomatic clearance which would expedite their departure vs. waiting in backlogged airport for routine clearances.” Ibid. In other words, diplomatic clearance expedited departure once the decision whether a person was allowed to depart had already been made. There is no evidence from these records or elsewhere that State worked to limit the FBI’s ability to screen passengers on the departing Saudi flights. See Jack Salata interview (June 14, 2004), stating that the State Department did not press the FBI to take any shortcuts in checking out passengers on the Saudi flights.

15 Richard Clarke Testimony before the Senate Judiciary Committee, Subcommittee on Terrorism, Technology and Homeland Security, Sept. 3, 2003, stating that the week of September 11, the State Department asked if the Saudis could evacuate some of their citizens; that he (Clarke) directed that the flight manifests for all the flights be vetted by the FBI and that the FBI “sign off” on the concept of Saudis being allowed to leave. “And as I recall, all of that was done.”

16 Richard Clarke interview (Jan. 12, 2004).

17 President Bush and Vice President Cheney meeting (Apr. 29, 2004); Condoleezza Rice meeting (Feb. 7, 2004); Prince Bandar interview (May 5, 2004); Richard Clarke interview (Jan. 12, 2004); Richard Clarke testimony, Mar. 24, 2004 (“I would love to be able to tell you who did it, who brought this proposal to me, but I don’t know”). Andrew Card, the White House Chief of Staff has told us that neither he, nor anyone else in the Chief of Staff’s Office, to his knowledge, got any call from the Saudis or told Clarke to do anything. Andrew Card interview (Mar. 31, 2004). However, he recalls “being aware” of the request or the issue as early as September 11 or September 12. Ibid. This appears to be the highest level within the U.S. government to which the matter rose.

18 See, e.g., FBI record, Information on “Bin Ladin” Family Flights that Departed the United States in September 2001, May 28, 2004, stating “Contacts with an SSA at FBIHQ (whose name was not recalled) coordinated this department to occur as soon as the FAA had authorized air traffic. SSA Foster further noted that during the hectic days following 9/11/2001, he spoke with several supervisors at FBIHQ concerning these issues, but did not keep specific records.” FBI Assistant Director Tom Pickard recalled being in the SIOC on September 13 or 14, and being told by one of three people—Dale Watson, Mike Rolince, and Steve Jennings, who has told us he had no involvement in the Saudi flights issue (Steve Jennings interview (June 9, 2004)—that the issue of a UBL family flight had come up on a secure video teleconference. Both Pickard and Watson told us that they did not participate in SVTC communications with Dick Clarke, and that the person frequently involved in those conferences in the SIOC was Mike Rolince. Tom Pickard interview (June 3, 2004); Dale Watson interview (June 3, 2004). Pickard was not able to recall who—he was told--had raised the issue on the SVTC, and said to us that he thought it had come from Richard Clarke.
or the State Department. He understood that the issue was that they wanted to leave the country. But, he
told us, there was no information suggesting that they were “here illegally or clandestinely.” Tom Pickard
interview (June 3, 2004). Pickard said that he knew prior to 9/11--when Usama Bin Ladin had been placed
onto the FBI’s Most Wanted List--that UBL had family members inside the U.S., that the FBI had “looked
at them,” and that the FBI had found “no connections” between these family members and UBL himself.
“Now we had this extended family who wanted permission to leave,” Pickard said. At the time, he said that
he viewed the issue as a “low priority,” given what he had been told and what he already knew about the
Bin Ladin family members. Pickard said that his approach was to tell his subordinate to handle the matter.
He told us that he did not believe he conveyed the need to come back to him about it. In the scheme of
things, Pickard said, he did not see anything to raise an alarm. Pickard did not recall discussing any other
flights beyond this one Saudi flight. Ibid. Similarly, Dale Watson recalls that at about the same time he
received the call from Rihab Massoud, the Deputy Chief of Mission of the Saudi Embassy in Washington,
the issue “came up to him” from within the FBI, possibly raised by Mike Rolince. Watson recalled being
told in this discussion that all the individuals on the flight had been identified and there was no one of
interest on the flight. Watson said he recalled telling whoever it was who raised it with him words to the
effect of “that’s fine.” Dale Watson interview (June 3, 2004).

19 See 8 CFR § 231.2 (Requiring that air carriers submit “a departure manifest” to an immigration officer
“at the port of departure . . . within 48 hours of the departure.”)

20 For example, as the Commission has previously reported, the 768 so-called “Special Interest” Aliens
detained after 9/11 by the INS in conjunction with the FBI were detained lawfully on immigration
violations.

21 United States law provides that no alien may depart the United States “if his departure would be
prejudicial to the interests of the United States,” 8 C.F.R § 15.2(a)(implementing INA § 215 --Travel
control of citizens and aliens), and includes within that category any alien “who is needed in the United
States as a witness in, or as a party to, any criminal case under investigation.” 8 CFR § 215.3(g). However,
the power to prevent departure under this law is vested in “departure control officers” that, prior to the
creation of the Department of Homeland Security, were employees of the Immigration and Naturalization
Service, not the FBI. 8 CFR § 215.1(i) (“The term departure-control officer means any immigration officer
as defined in the regulations of the Immigration and Naturalization Service”). In addition, persons
prevented from departing under this provision of law are provided with a hearing before a “special inquiry
officer and the law sets out the procedures and evidentiary requirements for such a hearing. 8 CFR § 215.4
(Procedure in case of alien prevented from departing from the United States), § 215.5 (Hearing procedure
before special inquiry officer). Thus, before an individual on one of these flights could have been prevented
from departing, the FBI would have needed some evidence that they had information about either the 9/11
attacks or some other terrorist activity. By insisting that they be able to identify all persons on these flights,
and by checking the biographical information of these persons against databases with derogatory
information, such as terrorist watchlists, the FBI took the logical steps necessary to develop such evidence.

22 According to FBI Special Agent Tim D., the Terrorist Screening Center (TSC) found one name match,
but the TIPOFF record was for an individual born in 1980, and the “Bin Ladin flight” passenger was listed

23 In order to be as comprehensive as possible, the TSC checked the names on the manifests listed on the
House of Bush/House of Saud website using the biographical information contained on those manifests.
With minor exceptions, the website contained data previously checked by the TSC prior to our April
hearing.

24 This information was reported on the House of Bush/House of Saud Web site as having been obtained by
the Judicial Watch organization from DHS pursuant to a FOIA request. However, the materials produced to
Judicial Watch did not have complete biographical information such as the name and passport number of
the individuals on these flights. The FBI obtained the complete records from DHS, and, at our request, ran
the complete list of names and other biographical data against the TIPOFF Terrorist watchlist. There were
no matches. Tim D. interview (June 30, 2004).

25 Although the FBI states that “a total of 18 Saudi passengers [were] aboard this flight,” that does not
seem possible since at least two of the names of the passengers – Gualberto Simpao Glore and Gilles
Gerard -- do not have Arabic names, and their passport numbers are not consistent with Saudi issuance.

26 We do not know the destination of this flight.
Kathy Steele, “Phantom Flight From Florida,” Tampa Tribune, Oct. 5, 2001. It was featured prominently in an article in Vanity Fair magazine and in articles and op-ed pieces in major newspapers and magazines. It has been discussed on television news shows. A U.S. Senator requested that the Justice Department Inspector General investigate it. Letter from United States Senator Charles Schumer to DOJ Inspector General Glenn Fine, June 16, 2004, stating “I am troubled that such a flight could have been allowed to take place just two days after the terrorist attacks of 9/11.”

This security detail began when one of the Saudis contacted a Tampa police officer and requested security fearing they would be attacked. Tampa police officers were then hired off-duty and were paid to provide security. John Solomon interview (June 4, 2004); Mike Fendle interview (June 4, 2004). We have reviewed documents provided by the Tampa Police Department regarding “extra-duty pay” provided for six hours by Detective Mike Fendle to “Sultan Bin Fahad” on September 13, 2001.

John Solomon interview (June 4, 2004).

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004).

John Solomon interview (June 4, 2004); Mike Fendle interview (June 4, 2004).

Mike Fendle interview (June 4, 2004); Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004).

Mike Fendle interview (June 4, 2004).

The Tampa officers were paid through the Tampa Police Department according to routine procedures. Mike Fendle interview (June 4, 2004); John Solomon interview (June 4, 2004). Dan Grossi reimbursed the Tampa Police Department with money he obtained in Lexington, Kentucky later on September 13. John Solomon interview (June 4, 2004); Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004).

Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004); Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004).

Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004); Barry Ellis interview (June 14, 2004).

Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004); FAA record, Supplemental Response to QFR No. 1, June 16, 2004.

Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004); Barry Ellis interview (June 14, 2004).

Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004).


FAA record, Response to QFR No. 1, June 8, 2004.

Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004).

Tampa’s system captures the noise made by planes taking off and landing at the airport and attaches that information to the aircraft type and flight identification number. Gigi Skipper interview (June 4, 2004). Tampa’s system recorded HPJ32, model LJ35 arriving at 3:34 p.m., departing at 4:37 p.m., arriving back in Tampa at 8:23 p.m. and departing for the last time at 8:48 p.m. Tampa International Airport record, Responses to QFRs, June 7, 2004.

FAA records show 30 flights departing Tampa Airport on September 13, including commercial flights departing as early as 12:43 p.m. FAA record, Response to Questions for the Record (QFR) No. 1, June 8, 2004.

The aircraft which arrived before this flight took off included: two general aviation flights, four “passenger” flights that included commercial airlines and four flights categorized as “other.” The aircraft that departed before this flight included one general aviation, eight passenger flights that included commercial airlines, and three flights categorized as “other.” Tampa International Airport record, responses to QFRs, June 7, 2004.

FAA record, Supplemental Response to QFRs, June 18, 2004.

Dan Grossi interview (June 14, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004); Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004); FAA record, Supplemental Response to QFR No. 1, June 16, 2004, indicating that this flight took off heading back to Tampa at 6:43 p.m..

Lexington-Blue Grass Airport record, Response to QFRs, June 8, 2004.

Mark Barnard interview (June 7, 2004), in which Barnard commented, “It happened. They flew from Tampa to Lexington,” and “Trust me. It landed. I was there.” See also, TAC Air record, Response to QFR,
June 9, 2004, Statement of Daniel Walsh, General Counsel that “I am aware of a trip that did arrive with persons of Arab descent. If my memory served me correctly, this aircraft was a Learjet.” Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004).

55 Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004).

56 Mark Barnard interview (June 7, 2004). These three individuals departed the United States days on a separate flight on September 16, 2001. Their departure is discussed below.

57 TAC Air record, Response to QFRs, June 9, 2004, with attachment TAC Air Daily Fuel Disbursement Report for “9/13/01” indicating a “Lear” with Tail “32HJ” received fuel at approximately 6:45 p.m.—the time on the log is unclear; FAA record, Supplemental Response to QFR No. 1, June 16, 2004.

58 Dan Grossi interview (May 24, 2004); Manuel Perez interview (May 27, 2004); Christopher Steele interview (June 14, 2004).

59 The FBI agrees that this flight occurred. James M. interview (June 18, 2004). Special Agent M. told the Commission that approximately one week after the 9/13/01 flight, he spoke with a Lexington Police officer who had provided security to the Saudi nationals on this flight. M. asked how the three young Saudis on the Tampa-Lexington flight arrived in Lexington and, when informed that they had flown, he questioned whether this was possible. M. says the officer “hemmed and hawed,” and then suggested that the three young Saudis actually drove to Lexington and said they had flown to avoid the displeasure of their elder male relative in Lexington. Special Agent M. told the Commission he now believes based on his own independent investigation that this flight in fact took place. Ibid.

60 FBI record, “All Passports Obtained by the FBI of Individuals on Northstar Aviation Flight from Providence, Rhode Island (Departing on or about September 14, 2001),” June 15, 2004. We have reviewed the copies of these passports collected by the FBI, and have not found anything unusual.


62 Christine Beyer interview (July 14, 2004).

63 According to the FBI, airport accounting records and log sheets prepared by airport personnel indicate the plane departed the airport at this time. Tim D. interview (July 14, 2004).


65 Ibid.

66 Port Authority of New York and New Jersey record, Responses to QFRs, July 9, 2004.

67 The FBI has provided us with a copy of the manifest for this flight. FBI record, “All Passports Obtained by the FBI of Individuals on a Chartered Boeing 727 flight from Lexington, Kentucky (Departing on or about September 16, 2001),” June 15, 2004.

68 We have reviewed copies of those passports and found nothing unusual.


70 Lexington-Blue Grass Airport record, Response to QFR, June 8, 2004.

71 FBI record, “All Passports Obtained by the FBI of Individuals on a Chartered Boeing 727 flight from Lexington, Kentucky (Departing on or about September 16, 2001),” June 15, 2004.


73 CIA record, Response to QFR, June 23, 2004. We found no evidence for this assertion in the interrogation reports of Abu Zubaydah we reviewed.

74 Boston-Logan Airport reopened to commercial air traffic at 5 a.m. on September 15, 2001. Massachusetts Port Authority record, Response to the Logan International Airport QFRs, June 17, 2004.


76 Ibid.

77 Ibid.


80 Ibid.
Las Vegas-McCarran International Airport reopened at 5 a.m., PST, on September 14, 2001. McCarran International Airport record, Responses to QFRs, June 17, 2004.

Although the FBI states that “a total of 18 Saudi passengers [were] aboard this flight,” that does not seem possible since at least two of the names of the passengers – Gualberto Simpao Glor and Gilles Gerard -- do not have Arabic names, and their passport numbers are not consistent with Saudi issuance.


There is conflicting evidence on which one of two individuals were actually on the flight. In its summary of these flights, the FBI lists “Maria Bayma” as a passenger on the flight manifest. However, another FBI record of this flight indicates that Khalil Bin Laden “and his wife and son” boarded in Orlando, Florida.

FBI record, Report of Leads Covered from FBI Los Angeles Office, Sept. 25, 2001. An analyst comment then states: “Khalil Bin Laden’s wife’s name is Isabel Bayma.” Ibid. Thus, it is unclear whether Isabel or Maria Bayma were on Flight 441. The FBI’s records indicate that Maria Bayma “appears to be a relative of Khalil Bin Laden’s wife, Isabel Bayma.” Ibid.

FBI record, “Final Draft of Response to October 2003 Vanity Fair Article (re: Bin Laden Family Departures after 9/11/2001),” Sept. 24, 2003. Although the Vanity Fair Article states Abdullah Bin Laden was on this flight, there is no evidence that Abdullah Bin Laden was on Ryan Air Flight 441.


Ibid.


FBI record, “Final Draft of Response to October 2003 Vanity Fair Article (re: Bin Laden Family Departures after 9/11/2001),” Sept. 24, 2003. The FBI agent reported that this flight was delayed two hours because flight crew members refused to fly upon learning “the identities of the passengers.” According to the agent, “The matter was resolved after the charter company agreed to pay each flight crew member an additional five thousand dollars.” FBI record, “All Interview Reports for Any Passengers on the Flights,” containing reports dated Sept. 13 through Sept. 26, 2001.


Ibid.

Ibid.


We say apparently because New York-JFK Airport informed us that they have no information on this “VIP” flight. James Begley email, June 10, 2004.

The website is www.houseofbush.com.

State Department logs contain a number of references to “VIPs” and “Saudi royals” in connection with proposed flights out of the country prior to this flight. In each case it is clear that the FAA and/or the FBI was involved in clearance for the flight. DOS record, “Terrorist Attack Task Force log,” September 16 and 17, 2001.


Hanscom Airfield reopened to commercial air traffic at 5 a.m. on September 15, 2001. Massachusetts Port Authority record, Response to the Hanscom Airfield QFRs, June 17, 2004.


Ibid.


Las Vegas-McCarran International Airport reopened at 5 a.m., PST, on September 14, 2001. McCarran International Airport, Responses to Questions for the Record, June 17, 2004.

Letter from Christopher Farrell of Judicial Watch to 9/11 Commission Executive Director Philip Zelikow, June 1, 2004.

Kelly B. interview (April 27, 2004).

Tim D. interview (June 30, 2004).
APPENDIX C

Immigration Histories of Certain Individuals with Terrorist Connections

The following analysis is based on information obtained primarily from reviewing immigration files, court documents and government reports. Individual INS immigration files were reviewed unless otherwise noted. The individuals whose immigration histories are discussed here are either known terrorists, or individuals with connections to terrorist attacks, including the 9/11 attacks, whose backgrounds are not discussed extensively in either the 9/11 Commission Report or Chapter 3 of this Staff Report.

- CIA Attack January 25, 1993

Mir Aimal Kansi aka Kasi

Place of birth: Pakistan
Date of birth: February 10, 1964

12/4/90 Using the alias of Mir Aimal Kasi, Kansi was issued a B-1 business visa at the U.S. Consulate in Karachi, Pakistan.

2/27/91 Kansi, still using the name Kasi, arrived in New York on Pakistani passport G399099. He was permitted to stay for one month, but remained in the country for a year without the permission of the Immigration and Naturalization Service, in violation of INA 237(a)(1)(A). This was grounds for deportation.

3/19/91 He was issued a new Pakistani passport at the Pakistani Embassy in Washington, D.C. in the name of Kansi. The new passport had a notation that it replaced Pakistani passport D398086, which was not the number of the passport he used to enter the U.S. a month earlier.

2/7/92 Kansi filed a claim for political asylum, claiming he illegally entered the United States on March 3, 1991 at New York City without inspection by the INS. He received permission from the INS to work in the United States while his application was pending. He obtained a Virginia driver’s license and began working for a courier service in the Washington, D.C. area. This political asylum claim was denied.

Kansi didn’t give up. He applied for legalization under the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986. One of the requirements of this amnesty program was that the applicant must have entered the United States illegally prior to January 1, 1982. Kansi claimed he entered the United States from Mexico and had lived here illegally from April 1981 to June 1987, a contradiction to his assertions in his political asylum petition. To support this claim, Kansi presented two leases, four letters of employment and one letter from a friend in Pakistan verifying a visit to that country. An examination of copies of these documents indicated that they all were typed on the same typewriter.

Kansi, however, missed the statutory filing deadline for this program. He then joined a class action lawsuit, Catholic Social Services v INS, involving aliens who also missed the
filing deadline or who had left the United States for a brief period of time.\textsuperscript{5} With his application pending, Kansi again applied for and received authorization to work in the United States.

4/15/92 The INS renewed Kansi’s work authorization.\textsuperscript{6}

1/25/93 Armed with an AK-47 assault rifle, Kansi opened fire on five male CIA employees while they sat in their cars at a stoplight in front of CIA headquarters in Langley, Virginia, killing Frank Darling and Lansing Bennett and seriously injuring three others. The following day Kansi fled to Pakistan.

2/16/93 The State of Virginia charged Kansi with murder, malicious wounding and five counts of using a firearm in the commission of a felony.\textsuperscript{7}

6/15/97 The FBI, working with Pakistani intelligence, arrested Kansi in a hotel.\textsuperscript{8}

11/10/97 After trial in Fairfax County, Virginia, Kansi was guilty of all counts, and sentenced to death for capital murder, life in prison for first degree murder, 20 years on each of the five counts of malicious wounding, two years in prison on one firearms charge and four years in prison on each of the other four firearms charges. Kansi was executed in 1998.
World Trade Center Bombing, February 26, 1993

Eyad Mahmoud Ismail aka Ismoil
Place of birth: Kuwait
Country of citizenship: Jordan
Date of birth: January 26, 1964

10/3/89 The U.S. consulate in Kuwait issued Ismail an F-1 student visa to study English in the United States.

10/9/89 He entered the United States at Honolulu and enrolled at Wichita State University in Kansas where he attended the English language program.

11/21/90 Ismail received approval from the INS to work part-time for one year while he was in school. He dropped out and eventually made his way to Texas. Because he was no longer a student, Ismail was in violation of the terms of his visa.

2/21/93 Ismail flew from Texas to New York City.

2/26/93 The World Trade Center was bombed. Ismail drove the van containing the bomb. That night he fled to Jordan.

9/12/94 Ismail was indicted on 10 counts for his role in the World Trade Center bombing.

8/3/95 Ismail was extradited from Jordan for prosecution in the United States.

11/13/97 Ismail was convicted and sentenced to 240 years in federal prison and ordered to pay restitution of $10 million.

Mohammed Abouhalima aka Abo Halima
Place of Birth: Egypt
Date of Birth: 2/23/64

7/22/85 Abouhalima entered the United States at New York on a B-2 tourist visa and was granted permission to remain in the country until Aug. 15, 1985.

11/6/85 Abouhalima asked the INS to extend his length of stay but his request was denied. He was ordered to voluntary depart the country before Dec. 5, 1995. He failed to comply and became in violation of immigration laws, subject to deportation.

9/30/87 Abouhalima filed for and received temporary residence under the Seasonal Agricultural Worker (SAW) program claiming to have picked beans in Florida. This program involved 1.3 million applications from aliens claiming to have worked for at least 90 days in agriculture from 1985 to 1986.
218

7/15/92  His application was denied after it was determined that he had never worked in agriculture.12

2/26/93  After the World Trade Center attack, Abouhalima was indicted as an accessory after the fact under 18 USC § 3, for his assistance to the first World Trade Center bombing terrorists. The indictment charged that he drove his brother, Mahmoud Abouhalima, to the airport knowing that he was involved in the bombing plot.

11/24/98  He was found guilty at trial and sentenced to 96 months in prison.

4/23/02  Based on his felony conviction Abouhalima was ordered deported following the service of his sentence. Abouhalima is in federal prison and scheduled for release on August 25, 2005.13

**Biblal A. Alkaisi aka Bibal Elqisi**
Place of Birth: Jordan14

11/5/90  Alkaisi attended a rally held by Rabbi Meir Kahane. He accompanied El Sayyid Nosair, who shot and killed Kahane at the event. Alkaisi was questioned about the shooting but released by the police.

8/20/91  The Islamic Brotherhood, Inc. in Brooklyn, New York wrote a letter in support of Bilal El Qisi’s application for temporary protected status. In their letter they used the same address as the Al-Farouq Mosque and the Alkifah Refugee Center, both locations since linked Islamist extremist activity.15

9/21/91  Still using the name of Bilal El Qisi, Alkaisi filed an application for temporary protected status (TPS) at the Cleveland, Ohio INS office.16 He stated that he was born in Lebanon on September 6, 1965 and that he entered the United States at New York City on September 25, 1988.17 He supported these claims with a Lebanese birth certificate and an INS Form I-94 (Arrival and Departure Record), which was later determined to have been altered to show a different country of birth.

3/11/92  The Cleveland INS office initiated an investigation into a number of suspected fraudulent TPS applications, including Alkaisi’s.

3/19/92  The INS Forensic Document Laboratory completed an examination of Alkaisi’s Lebanese birth certificate and concluded it was produced by a color copier. The English translation of the Arabic document was also incorrect. In addition, the INS I-94 Record of Entry and Departure that Alkaisi submitted with his application was altered to change the country of birth.

5/22/92  Bibal El Qisi filed a request for political asylum, now claiming he was born in Jordan on December 20, 1965 and had entered the United States on October 10, 1987 in New York via Jordan Airlines. He claimed he was not inspected by the INS and said that he lived in
Brooklyn, New York. The INS assigned him a new case file. INS recordkeeping did not connect this application with his previous one.

7/13/92 El Qisi failed to appear for his political asylum interview.

7/28/92 As a result of his failure to appear the INS terminated action on his political asylum claim.

2/26/93 The World Trade Center was bombed.

3/25/93 A known associate of the conspirators, El Qisi was arrested by the FBI office in Newark, New Jersey. He told the agents that his name was Bilal Salem Alkaiisi and that he was born on December 25, 1965 in Jordan. The ensuing investigation revealed that all of the residences and employments that Alkaiisi had listed on his political asylum claim were false.

8/8/93 Under the name El Qisi, Alkaiisi was indicted with five other co-conspirators for his part in the bombing. The U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of New York later severed Alkaiisi from the indictment due to a lack of evidence.

5/9/94 Alkaiisi plead guilty to making false statements to the INS.18

5/19/94 The INS certified that there was no record of an entry of Alkaiisi under that name or any of his other aliases.

7/123/94 Alkaiisi was sentenced to 20 months in prison for making false statements in his political asylum claim.

11/7/94 He was released from Federal prison and deported to Jordan the following day.

Nidal Abderrahman Ayyad
Place of birth: Kuwait
Country of citizenship: Jordan
Date of birth: July 17, 1967

7/15/85 Abderrahman Yousif Ayyad, a legal permanent resident, petitioned the INS to bring his son Nidal to the United States.

10/10/85 His petition was granted and Nidal Ayyad entered the United States at New York City as the unmarried son of a lawful permanent resident.

2/21/91 Nidal applied for naturalization at the INS office in Newark, and swore allegiance to the United States.

3/7/91 Nidal became a naturalized citizen in a ceremony in Newark.
2/26/93 The World Trade center was bombed. The following day Nidal called the *New York Times*, proclaiming the bombing to be the work of the “Liberation Army.”

5/24/94 Nidal was charged and convicted as part of the World Trade Center plot, and was sentenced to 240 years in prison for conspiracy to destroy buildings with an explosive device, explosive destruction of property, destruction of a motor vehicle, assault of a federal officer and using or carrying a destructive device during a crime of violence.

5/28/96 The INS Newark office recommended that Nidal’s citizenship be revoked based on his membership in a terrorist group before and after his naturalization. The recommendation is based on INA 340 (a)(2) “withholding of a material fact,” section 340(c) “reopening of naturalization proceedings” and 313(3) “membership in groups advocating the violent overthrow of the government of the United States.” It does not appear that action was taken to formally revoke his citizenship. The Commission was not provided access to his immigration file, and the Department of Homeland Security advised that his file was protected by the Privacy Act, which covers citizens, legal permanent residents and naturalized citizens. Ayyad is scheduled for release on April 3, 2095.
**Mohammed Salameh**

Place of birth: Jordan  
Date of birth: September 1, 1967

4/8/84 The Jordanian Passport office in Amman issued passport #B468365 to Mohammad Amin Abdel-Rahim Salameh. Ramzi Yousef’s fingerprints were later found on this passport.

11/5/90 Rabbi Meir Kahane was shot to death by El Sayyid Nosair. Salameh was arrested that night at one of Nosair’s addresses and admitted that he was with Nosair at the shooting. However, the next day Salameh was released for lack of evidence.

9/22/92 Salameh submitted a fraudulent Seasonal Agricultural Worker (SAW) application in an attempt to become a legal permanent resident. He claimed that he planted tomatoes, and weeded and picked green beans for Oak Valley Farms in Crawford, Texas.

2/26/93 Salameh drove a rented Ryder van containing a bomb into the World Trade Center.

3/4/93 Salameh was arrested trying to obtain a $400 refund on the rented truck. He was later charged with criminal violations of the immigration laws and prosecuted on charges related to the bombing.

3/4/94 Salameh was convicted in Federal court of all charges including 8 USC § 1546(a) (“fraud and misuse of visas, permits and other documents”) and was sentenced to 240 months in Federal prison. His projected release date is January 2, 2024.

**Mahmud Abouhalima aka “Mahmud the Red”**

Place of birth: Egypt  
Date of birth: November 17, 1959

1985 Abouhalima and his German wife, Marianne Weber, entered the United States on tourist visas. They were admitted for six months but overstay their authorized length of stay.

1987 Abouhalima applied for amnesty under the Special Agricultural Program (SAW) program claiming that he worked seven months on a South Carolina farm. There were indications that this claim was fraudulent, namely that Abouhalima was in New York and never worked on a farm. Nevertheless, he received his legal permanent resident alien status (green card).

11/5/90 Abouhalima was supposed to drive the getaway taxi from the Marriott Eastside Hotel after Nosair’s assassination of Rabbi Meir Kahane. While he waited for Nosair, an employee at the hotel ordered him to move his car, which was blocking the hotel entrance. That night Abouhalima was arrested along with Mohammed Salameh and others. However, like Salameh, he was released for lack of evidence.
Abouhalima filed Form I-131, Application for a Travel Document, listing an expected departure on March 6, 1993 for Egypt. This allowed him to remain abroad for more than one year without losing his legal resident status.

The World Trade Center was bombed. Abouhalima drove behind the Ryder rental truck carrying the bomb. He then drove the group away from the scene.

Abouhalima fled to Sudan via Jeddah, Saudi Arabia.

One of Abouhalima’s fingerprints was found in one of the bomb-making manuals seized from another bombing conspirator, Ahmad Ajaj, when Ajaj had entered the United States at JFK airport in New York on September 1, 1992. Another fingerprint belonging to Ramzi Yousef, the mastermind of the plot, was found on the same manual. After a worldwide search, he was arrested by FBI agents in Egypt and returned to the United States where he was tried on terrorism charges. He was convicted and sentenced to 1,300 months in prison. His is scheduled for release on September 2, 2087.

- Plot to Destroy New York City Landmarks June 24, 1993

Matarawy Mohammed Said Saleh
Place of birth: Egypt
Date of birth: March 4, 1956

Using the alias Wahid Mohamed Ahmed, Saleh married Evelyn Cortez, a United States citizen. Based on this marriage, Cortez filed INS form I-130, Petition to Classify Status of Alien Relative in INS New York City. This application started the process of acquiring legal permanent residency for Saleh. In the petition, Saleh claimed to be a self-employed scuba diver. It also claimed both he and his wife lived at the same address in the Bronx.

The INS denied the petition on the ground that Cortez failed to submit a divorce decree from her previous marriage. The denial was sent by certified mail but was returned marked “unclaimed.”

Still married to Cortez, Saleh married Leslie Sonkin, also a United States citizen, in a ceremony in Egypt. They then filed an immigrant visa petition for Saleh claiming Saleh had never been previously married.

Saleh entered the United States at New York City as a conditional resident alien based on his marriage to Sonkin. This status allowed him to remain in the United States legally for two years after which time he could file to permanently remain in the United States.

Saleh was convicted in federal court for selling heroin in Detroit and sentenced to five years’ imprisonment. He was paroled after two and a half years and turned over to the INS for deportation on the basis of his conviction.
12/18/90 The INS initiated deportation proceedings while Saleh was detained in Oakdale, Louisiana. One month later, Sultan El Gawly posted an $8,000 bail with the INS to secure Saleh’s release. The deportation order was still pending.

3/31/93 Saleh’s conditional residence status was terminated by the INS.

7/16/93 The FBI interviewed Saleh’s wife Evelyn Cortez, who claimed she had re-married to Ashraf Mohammed. She claimed that she had a son by Saleh six years earlier.

7/22/93 Saleh was arrested by a joint INS-FBI team in Wildwood, New Jersey.

12/15/95 Saleh was convicted of conspiracy to bomb various targets in New York City. He was sentenced to time served and placed on supervised release for three years despite his outstanding deportation order, despite his illegal immigration status, heroin conviction, violation of probation, assault of his ex-wife Cortez, assaults on his current wife, and involvement in credit card fraud and theft.

6/4/96 The INS Philadelphia office issued an arrest warrant for Saleh for his violation of immigration laws. Shortly thereafter he was arrested by INS Special Agents at the Federal Probation office in Wilkes-Barre, Pennsylvania, and placed in INS custody.

6/27/96 Based on his terrorism conviction, Saleh was placed in administrative deportation proceedings as an aggravated felon. This procedure did not involve a deportation hearing.

9/25/96 Saleh was served with a final notice of deportation. Egypt issued a temporary travel document allowing Saleh to travel only to Egypt.

11/19/96 Saleh was released from prison and deported to Egypt.

El Sayyid Nosair
Place of birth: Egypt

1981 Nosair entered the United States at an unknown time and place. He obtained legal permanent residence status based on his marriage to a United States citizen.

1985 Nosair moved to New Jersey and became a regular visitor at the Alkifah Refugee Center in Brooklyn where he contacted Sheik Rahman, an Egyptian radical cleric also known as the Blind Sheik.

9/27/89 Nosair was naturalized in Newark, New Jersey. Prior to his naturalization he was observed, while under surveillance by the FBI, shooting a variety of weapons with other suspected Muslim militants at a firing range. The INS was not aware of this fact.

11/5/90 Nosair shot and killed radical Jewish Rabbi Meir Kahane in front of a crowd of followers at the Marriott Eastside Hotel in New York City. He also shot an elderly man who tried to
stop him. He accidentally got into the wrong taxi, believing it was the getaway car driven by Mahmud Abouhalima. Realizing his mistake, he jumped out of the taxi with his gun still in his hand. He was confronted by an off-duty postal inspector. Both were shot in the ensuing gun fight.

11/8/90 The FBI raided Nosair’s apartment. They found numerous military documents from Ft. Bragg, North Carolina. The documents were traced to Ali Mohammed, a sergeant in the Army Special Forces. Mohammed, an FBI informant, was later convicted for his role in the bombings of the U.S. embassies in Kenya and Tanzania in 1998.

12/21/91 At trial, Nosair was found not guilty of murder and attempted murder. He was convicted of carrying a weapon and of assault. He was sentenced to eight years’ imprisonment.

2/26/93 The World Trade Center was bombed.

3/4/93 FBI agents obtained a search warrant for Ibrahim el Gabrowny’s apartment in connection with the bombing investigation. There, FBI agents found Nosair’s U.S. passport, five Nicaraguan passports issued in July 1991 and five Nicaraguan birth certificates for Nosair, his wife and his three children as well as Nicaraguan drivers’ licenses. The foreign documents were in alias names.

5/8/96 The INS recommended revoking Nosair’s naturalization based on his lack of “good moral character,” required for naturalization. He was also subject to a violation of 18 USC § 1425 for having unlawfully obtained naturalization. We have found no evidence that further action has been taken with regard to this recommendation. Nosair is currently serving a life sentence in Federal prison. His projected release date is September 2, 2087.

Abdel Rahman Yasin

Yasin was born in Indiana to Iraqi parents. His father was a graduate student. Yasin left the United States and grew up in Baghdad. Later he returned to the United States to live with his mother in Jersey City, New Jersey.

6/21/92 Yasin applied for a new U.S. passport in Amman, Jordan, to replace one he claimed to have lost.

Ramzi Yousef, the mastermind of the 1993 bombing of the World Trade Center, stayed at Yasin’s apartment before the bombing. They also mixed the chemicals for the bomb. During this process, Yasin’s leg was burned by chemicals.

2/26/93 The World Trade Center was bombed. As part of the investigation the FBI questioned Yasin whom they encountered while executing a search warrant. He provided information on Ramzi Yousef, who had fled the United States. He also took the agents to the apartment where the bomb chemicals were mixed. Yasin appeared helpful and open and was released by the FBI. He immediately disappeared.
CBS news reporter Lesley Stahl located Yasin, then living in Baghdad, and interviewed him. Yasin remains a fugitive, his whereabouts unknown.

Begin Text Box
The Landmarks Conspirators

A number of conspirators in the June 1993 plot to blow up the Federal building, the FBI office, the Lincoln and Holland Tunnels, and the George Washington Bridge, obtained legal permanent residency or were naturalized citizens. The Privacy Act prevented our review of their files. They are:

- Fadil Abdelghani. Currently in Federal prison, projected release date of April 5, 2015.
- Siddig Ibrahim Siddiq Ali.

End Text Box

- Plot to Destroy the New York City Subway

In this plot two illegal immigrants conspired to blow up the Atlantic Avenue subway in Brooklyn, New York. The plot was discovered shortly before five bombs were planted.

Mohamed Mustafa Khalil
Place of birth: Amman, Jordan
Date of birth: October 5, 1974

7/6/96 Khalil was issued Jordanian passport E925402 in Amman, Jordan. He applied for and received a Canadian tourist visa.

11/19/96 Khalil traveled to Toronto. He was permitted to study English in Canada.

1/14/97 Khalil was arrested by INS Border Patrol officers at a Greyhound Bus station in Bellingham, Washington during routine patrol duties. Khalil told the Border Patrol that he had crossed the Canadian border with co-conspirator Abu Mezer (See chapter 3) in a taxi but was not inspected by the INS. Khalil had violated immigration law by failing to obtain a visa to visit the United States. He was detained without bond until his detention hearing.
1/29/97 Immigration Judge Anna Ho set bail at $10,000.

2/27/97 At the deportation hearing, Khalil said he wanted to apply for political asylum. His bond was reduced to $5,000. It was posted by Kamal Hourani, an acquaintance. Khalil told the judge that upon release from INS custody he planned to live in Centreville, Virginia.

7/4/97 Khalil told the INS that he had married Sofina Assaf, a United States citizen residing in Canada.

8/1/97 Khalil was arrested in New York City during the investigation of the New York subway bombing plot.42

11/12/97 Khalil was released from prison and deported to Jordan.43

- The Manila Air Plot

In 1994, KSM accompanied Ramzi Yousef to the Philippines, and the two of them began planning what is now known as the Manila air or “Bojinka” plot—the intended bombing of 12 U.S. commercial jumbo jets over the Pacific during a two-day span.

Abdul Hakim Murad aka Ahmed Saeed
Place of birth: Pakistan; raised in Kuwait
Date of birth: January 4, 1968

Late in 1994, KSM sent $3,000 to Ramzi Yousef in the Philippines to fund the plot. Another conspirator, Murad, transported the money.44

1/6/95 Murad was arrested by the Philippine police in Manila after he returned to the scene of a small fire at the Dona Josefa Apartments where he had been building bombs with Ramzi Yousef. Murad had wanted to retrieve his laptop. Following 67 days of interrogation he disclosed the substance of the plot—planting bombs aboard U.S. airliners and a related plan to fly an explosives-laden plane into the CIA. At the time of his arrest, Murad used the alias of Ahmed Saeed.

4/12/95 Murad was transported to the United States where he testified at the trial of Ramzi Yousef, who had been extradited from Pakistan. Murad was charged with terrorist acts in Federal court and was sentenced to life imprisonment. Murad is currently in federal prison serving a life sentence.45
Other persons of interest

Eyaed Mohammed Mohammed Mustafa aka Eyad M. Mustafa al Rababah

Place of birth: Jordan
Date of birth: July 21, 1972

3/21/99 Rababah entered the United States at New York City as a tourist and was admitted until September 20, 1999. He said he was going to Bridgeport, Connecticut.

10/12/00 Rababah was arrested by the Virginia Department of Motor Vehicles for assisting persons to illegally obtain Virginia driver’s licenses and Virginia identification cards. Rababah later pleaded guilty to a misdemeanor offense in connection with these charges.

5/01 Rababah told the FBI that he met two Saudi males, “Nawaf” and “Hani,” at a 7-11 convenience store in Falls Church, Virginia. Rababah told the pair that he could assist them in obtaining driver’s licenses.

6/01 Rababah received a phone call from his former roommate in Virginia that the two men he met—Nawaf and Hani—had tried to contact him. Rababah spoke to Nawaf who said that he had two other friends who would like to “travel around.” Rababah, who had since moved to Connecticut, drove to Virginia to pick up the four men. The following day Rababah drove them to the Fairfield Motor Inn in Fairfield, Connecticut. They stayed for two nights.

9/28/01 Rababah voluntarily told the FBI in New Haven, Conn. that he may have known some of the 9/11 hijackers. The men were subsequently identified by Rababah as hijackers Ahmed al Ghamdi, Hani Hanjour, Majed Moqed and Nawaf al Hamzi.

The FBI contacted the INS Hartford office regarding Rababah’s immigration status. At 11:30 p.m., two Hartford INS agents took Rababah into custody. The following day Rababah was charged with overstaying his tourist visa in violation of INA § 237(a)(1)(B), and detained.

9/30/01 A material witness warrant was issued against Rababah in connection with the 9/11 plot and he was transferred to the INS detention center in New York, and then to the Metropolitan Correctional Center (MCC). The INS filed a detainer with the MCC and closed the immigration proceeding against him since he was no longer in INS custody. The detainer directed the MCC to turn Rababah over to the INS when he was released.

11/16/01 A criminal complaint was filed against Rababah in the U.S. Court for the Eastern District of Virginia charging him with knowingly and without lawful authority producing an identity document, and aiding and abetting the same, in violation of 18 USC § 2 and 8 USC § 1028(a)(1), § (b)(1)(A)(ii), and § (c)(3)(A). A federal arrest warrant was issued for Eyad M. Al Rababah for the document fraud charges.
12/8/01 The INS filed a detainer with the U.S. Marshal for the Eastern District of Virginia where Rababah had been transferred to stand trial.

5/20/02 Rababah was convicted and sentenced to six months imprisonment and ordered to pay a special assessment of $200. His sentence was conditioned on his cooperation with the INS and his agreement not to oppose any removal or deportation action.

The deportation hearing was postponed a number of times at the request of Rababah’s attorney. Rababah sought to have his bail reduced so that he could be released in order to marry his American girlfriend. The INS legal counsel concluded that the special conditions included as part of the sentence were unenforceable because the federal court order involved matters of criminal law, but immigration hearings involved administrative law.

10/17/02 The INS received a letter from the FBI stating that Rababah was no longer of investigative interest to them.

10/22/02 A deportation hearing was held. Rababah requested political asylum, protection under the convention against torture, and relief from deportation. The Immigration Judge ruled that Rababah did not provide sufficient evidence to support his claims for relief and ordered him removed from the United States.

11/4/02 Rababah lost the appeal of his removal order.

7/10/03 Rababah was deported to Jordan via Paris.

**Anwar Nasser Aulaqi aka al Awalaki**
Place of birth: Yemen
Date of birth: 1971

Aulaqi entered the United States at an unknown place as a J-1 Exchange Visitor. He enrolled in the civil engineering program at Colorado State University. He later obtained legal permanent residence status in the United States; we were unable to determine on what basis this status was granted.

Aulaqi was a cleric who preached at the Dar al-Hijrah Islamic Center in Falls Church, Virginia and at a mosque in San Diego. He became a “spiritual adviser” to hijackers Nawaf al Hazmi and Khalid al Midhar. Eyad al Rababah was also a member of the Falls Church mosque. Aulaqi’s telephone number was found when police raided Ramzi Binalshibh’s apartment in Hamburg, German.

**Mohdar Mohamed Abdullah**
Place of birth: Yemen
Date of birth: May 8, 1978
229

4/14/99 Abdullah requested and received political asylum based on his claim of religious persecution in Somalia.

1/15/02 Nawaf al Hazmi and Khalid al Mihdhar arrived in Southern California. They eventually met Mohdar Abdullah who assisted them in their housing search and helped them with English translations. 51

10/3/02 Abdullah received a “Notice of Intent to Terminate Asylum Status” before an immigration judge based on his fraudulent political asylum claim. The INS had determined that he was a citizen of Yemen, not Somalia, and had entered the United States as a temporary visitor on December 10, 1998, from Canada using a Yemeni passport. Abdullah had testified that he illegally entered the United States on December 7, 1998, in New York on an Italian passport.

Abdullah was indicted in the Southern District of California for violations of 18 USC § 371 (Conspiracy), 18 USC § 1546 (False Statement in an Immigration Application), 18 USC §1001 (False Statements) and 18 USC § 2 (Aiding and Abetting).

7/19/02 Abdullah pleaded guilty to 18 USC § 1001 (False Statements) for submitting fraudulent documents in support of his political asylum claim. While in custody on these charges, Abdullah reportedly claimed that he knew about the 9/11 attack weeks before it happened. 52

10/02/02 Abdullah was released from federal prison and transferred to the custody of the INS. 53

5/21/04 Abdullah was deported to Yemen. 54
• Los Angeles Airport murder on July 4, 2002\textsuperscript{55}

**Hesham Mohamed Ali Hedayet aka Hadayet**

Date of birth: July 4, 1961  
Place of birth: Egypt

11/14/87 Hadayet was issued Egyptian passport 69662.

7/13/92 He received a multiple entry B-2 tourist visa from the U.S. Consulate in Cairo, Egypt.

7/31/92 He entered the United States at Los Angeles as a tourist and was admitted until January 25, 1993.

12/01/92 Hadayet filed an application for political asylum and permission to work. He claimed he would be persecuted for his religious beliefs if he returned to Egypt. Specifically, Hadayet claimed to be a member of “Assad Eben Furat Mosque Association,” which called for a strict Islamist government. Hadayet also claimed to have been arrested many times over the previous 14 years by the Egyptian secret police for his strong religious beliefs. Based on his asylum application, he was approved for an Employment Authorization Document (EAD) by the Los Angeles INS office.

3/93 Hadayet’s wife arrived in the United States with their son, an Egyptian citizen. There was no immigration record of their arrival.\textsuperscript{56}

3/8/93 Hadayet’s permission to work was approved for another year.

3/30/93 Hadayet was interviewed about his political asylum claim. He lied about the presence of his wife and son in the United States. Concealment of this material fact was grounds for denial of his petition.

3/7/95 After reviewing all the facts in the case, the INS issued a “Notice of Intent to Deny the Political Asylum Claim.” Hadayet was given thirty days to respond. He did not.

3/18/94 Hadayet received another one-year renewal of his employment authorization. He worked as a chauffeur, mainly at the Los Angeles airport.

10/19/95 Deportation proceedings were initiated for his previous overstay in 1992. Hadayet’s permission to work was also terminated. His deportation hearing was scheduled for March 26, 1996. All case documents were sent to him via certified mail.

The certified mail was returned “undeliverable.” Because he did not receive the official INS notification of his deportation hearing, under INS regulations he was not placed in the Deportable Alien Control System (DACS) system. Thus, no one at INS was tracking him or looking for him.
3/29/96 Deportation proceedings against Hadayet were terminated because he could not be located.

6/96 Hadayet applied to renew his employment authorization. The DACS was checked but because Hadayet’s name was not entered, he received authorization to work another year.

Meanwhile, his wife won one of the 50,000 “diversity immigrant visas” issued in an annual lottery, and was granted legal permanent residence status in the United States.

1/97 Hadayet’s wife filed an application for permanent residence for Hadayet based on her status as a legal resident.57

8/29/97 Hadayet was approved for permanent residence as an asylee.

5/3/00 Hadayet was issued a second California driver’s license in the name Hesham Mohamed Hadayet. His previous driver’s license was in the name of Hesham Mohamed Ali.

7/4/02 Hadayet drove to the Los Angeles Airport armed with a .45 caliber pistol, a 9-millimeter automatic handgun and a hunting knife. He approached the El Al ticket counter and shot and killed an El Al employee and a man waiting in line. He was shot and killed by a security officer.

---

1 See DHS document, immigration file A72 415 284 and immigration file A93 249 086.
2 The new passport contained a curious notation that the correct name on the passport should be “Kansi.”
3 Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986, Eligibility for Temporary Resident Status Under the Main Legalization Program
4 He also provided a completed form requesting status in a class action lawsuit against the INS by the League of United Latin American Citizens (LULAC).
6 See DHS document, immigration file A93 249 086.
7 Kansi’s roommate, Zahed Ahmad Mir, was visited by law enforcement authorities after the CIA attack and permitted the police to seize two handguns and magazines for the AK-47 believed to be used by Kansi in the shooting. Mir was later arrested and convicted of fraud for his application for amnesty under the Seasonal Agricultural Worker (SAW) provisions of the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986. This provision permitted illegal aliens who had engaged in seasonal agricultural work for at least 90 days to apply for amnesty and receive legal residence in the United States. Mir falsely asserted on his SAW application that he entered the United States in 1985 and picked “watermelons, cantaloupe and assorted other crops” for a farm in Georgia. See DHS document, immigration file A93 001 385.
8 Mir Aimal Kasi v. Commonwealth of Virginia (Virginia Supreme Court), Circuit Court of Fairfax County, Record Numbers 980797 and 980798, Nov. 6, 1998.
9 See DHS document, immigration file A73 140 727.
11 See DHS document, immigration file A 91 184 226.
12 The petitioner on his behalf, Lee Artis Breedlove, a Florida farm owner, claimed to have employed Abouhalima and others. Breedlove pled guilty in federal court to issuing 260 fraudulent employment records used by aliens in their SAW applications.
13 Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.
14 See DHS documents, immigration files A71 495 857, A93 003 841 and A94 010 816. Only parts of these files were available for our review.

Section 244 of the Immigration and Nationality Act grants temporary protected status (TPS) to eligible nationals of designated countries (or parts thereof) as determined by the Attorney General. TPS can be given to aliens in the United States who are temporarily unable to safely return to their home country because of ongoing armed conflict, the temporary effects of an environmental disaster, or other extraordinary and temporary conditions.

Alkaisi could not get TPS as a citizen of Jordan. Lebanon was a designated Temporary Protected Status country.

18 USC § 1001 (False Statements).

Memorandum of Record, “Request for Recommendation re: Revocation of Naturalization”, from Warren Louis, INS District Director, Newark, NJ to Carol D. Chasse, Regional Director, INS Eastern Region, May 28, 1996.

His INS immigration file (A 90 678 144) was not available for review. Although the Department of Homeland Security (Bureau of Immigration and Customs Enforcement) stated that the file had been located in New York City, it was not provided to the Commission. They did state that the individual was not a legal permanent resident or naturalized citizen.

Trial exhibit, WTC 1, U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York.

His INS immigration file (A 90 568 993) was not available for review. DHS informed us that the Privacy Act barred the Commission from obtaining immigration files on legal permanent residents and naturalized citizens, even those convicted of terrorism or related crimes.

See DHS documents, immigration files A41 066 738 and A27 520 221.

This was Cortez’s second marriage; her first husband, Jonathan Rivera Rosario, was also an alien. See DHS document, immigration file A27 520 221.

The petition was for Wahid Mohamed Ahmed (alias for Saleh) with a date of birth of June 13, 1950.

INA Section 213, Conditional Residence, states “this status, based on marriage, lasts for two years after entry if the marriage was less than two years prior to day you have received your permanent residence”.

This was a violation of 21 USC § 841(a)(1) and 18 USC § 2.

18 USC § 371, 18 USC § 844 (i) and 18 USC § 842(a)(3)(A).

Under immigration law, because the INS had placed a detainer on him, Saleh ordinarily would have been turned over to them for deportation following his release.

Relief from deportation is available to someone convicted of terrorism under immigration law if they can show “hardship,” which Saleh could not do based on his terrorism and drug convictions.

His Immigration file (A 23 406 577) was not available for review. The Privacy Act barred the Commission from obtaining this file.

Many birth records were destroyed in an earthquake in Nicaragua on December 23, 1972. Applications for Nicaraguan passports do not require a personal visit.

INS Memo to File from District Counsel, INS, Newark, New Jersey, undated.

He also might have held an Iraqi passport M0887925 in the name of Abdul Rahman S. Taher. See FBI fugitive web site www.fbi.gov/mostwant/topten/fugitives/fugitives.


Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.

Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.

Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.

Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.

See DHS document, immigration file A73 442 758.

A warrant of arrest was issued by Aaron Miller, Assistant Chief Patrol Agent, Bellingham, Washington for Khalil’s immigration violations.

On August 11, 1997, the INS requested that Khalil be tried in New York, rather than in Arlington, Virginia since he was being held in New York City as a material witness in the attempted bombing. The judge agreed to move the case.

Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.

45 Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons.
46 See DHS document, immigration file A78 392 527. The A file contains poor quality copies of two passports belonging to Rababah. Jordanian passport E041890 was issued on March 3, 1994 and was valid until March 8, 1999. Jordanian passport G263860 was issued on March 1, 1999 and was valid until March 12, 2004.
47 He had entered the United States two times before on a B-2 multiple entry tourist visa.
49 His INS immigration file was not available for review. The Privacy Act barred the Commission from obtaining immigration files on legal permanent residents and naturalized citizens.
50 See DHS document, immigration file A75 628 802.
53 Department of Justice, Bureau of Prisons.
55 See DHS document, immigration file A70 640 955.
56 Testimony by William Yates, Deputy Executive Associate Commissioner, Immigration Services Division before the House Subcommittee on Immigration, Border Security, and Claims, House Committee on the Judiciary, Oct. 9, 2002.
57 Since she was a legal permanent resident alien, her immigration file is covered by the Privacy Act and the Commission was barred from reviewing it.